

also provides very valuable information for the design of future studies, such as field testing inclusion/exclusion criteria and study endpoints, as well as injecting some increased confidence into the process of estimating the effect size that steroid treatment might provide to SARS patients, thus allowing more rigorous power calculations to determine prospective sample size. Ho and coworkers are wise to be circumspect in the conclusions they draw—namely, that this report helps guide SARS therapy but only until data from randomized trials become available (6).

Twenty-five years ago (1978) Craddock wrote about the “hypercortisolism” of severe acute illness suggesting that the immunologic response to self-antigens exposed by disease or trauma may be suppressed by corticosteroids to offset the likelihood of autoimmune attack (15). This kind of thinking has provided support for the notion of corticosteroid supplementation as treatment for acute, critical illness, and additional support can be drawn from the report of Annane and coworkers (16). No doubt, with the next outbreak of SARS, studies of its pathophysiology will continue, as will well controlled clinical trials comparing treatments and combinations of treatments, including corticosteroids. Until those results are available, the medical community will have very limited information with which to determine whether steroids are an appropriate treatment for SARS, but will have some important decisions to make if SARS returns. Once SARS pathophysiology becomes better understood and we accumulate the results of clinical trials that are consistent and reproducible, we may have the answer to the corticosteroid question. If not, we may still be debating the use of steroids in SARS for another 25 years.

**Conflict of Interest Statement:** G.R.B. has no declared conflict of interest.

GORDON R. BERNARD, M.D.  
Vanderbilt University School of Medicine  
Nashville, Tennessee

## References

1. So LK, Lau ACW, Yam LYC, Cheung TMT, Poon E, Yung RWH, Yuen KY. Development of a standard treatment protocol for severe acute respiratory syndrome. *Lancet* 2003;361:1615–1617.
2. Wang J, Yanqing D, Li X, Yang L, Zhang W, Kang W. Fatal Aspergillosis in a patient with SARS who was treated with corticosteroids. *N Engl J Med* 2003;349:5.
3. Cyranoski D. Critics slam treatment for SARS as ineffective and perhaps dangerous. *Nature* 2003;423:4.

4. Booth CM, Matukas LM, Tomlinson GA, Rachlis AR, Rose DB, Dwosh HA, Walmsley SL, Mazzulli T, Avendano M, Derkach P, et al. Clinical features and short-term outcomes of 144 patients with SARS in the greater Toronto area. *JAMA* 2003;289:2801–2809. (Erratum appears in *JAMA* 2003;290:334).
5. Chan JW, Ng CK, Chan YH, Mok TY, Lee S, Chu SY, Law WL, Lee MP, Li PC. Short term outcome and risk factors for adverse clinical outcomes in adults with severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS). *Thorax* 2003;58:686–689.
6. Ho JC, Ooi GC, Mok TY, Chan JW, Hung I, Lam B, Wong PC, Li PC, Ho PL, Lam WK, et al. High-dose pulse versus nonpulse corticosteroid regimens in severe acute respiratory syndrome. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2003;168:1449–1456.
7. Nicholls JM, Poon LL, Lee KC, Ng WF, Lai ST, Leung CY, Chu CM, Hui PK, Mak KL, Lim W, et al. Lung pathology of fatal severe acute respiratory syndrome. *Lancet* 2003;361:1773–1778.
8. Bernard GR, Harris T, Luce JE, Rinaldo J, Sibbald WJ, Sprung C, Tate RM, Higgins S, Kariman K, Bradley R, et al. High dose corticosteroids in patients with the adult respiratory distress syndrome: a randomized double-blind trial. *N Engl J Med* 1987;317:1565–1570.
9. Meduri GU, Headley AS, Golden E, Carson SJ, Umberger RA, Kelso T, Tolley EA. Effect of prolonged methylprednisolone therapy in unresolving acute respiratory distress syndrome: a randomized controlled trial. *JAMA* 1998;280:159–165.
10. Cohen AJ, King TE, Downey GP. Rapidly progressive bronchiolitis obliterans with organizing pneumonia. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1994;149:1670–1675.
11. Smego RA, Ahmed N. A systematic review of the adjunctive use of systemic corticosteroids for pulmonary tuberculosis. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2003;7:208–213.
12. The National Institutes of Health—University of California Expert Panel for Corticosteroids as Adjunctive Therapy for *Pneumocystis carinii*. Consensus statement on the use of corticosteroids as adjunctive therapy for *Pneumocystis pneumonia* in the acquired immunodeficiency syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 1990;323:1500–1504.
13. Bone RC, Fisher CJ Jr, Clemmer TP, Slotman GJ, Metz CA, Balk RA. A controlled clinical trial of high-dose methylprednisolone in the treatment of severe sepsis and septic shock. *N Engl J Med* 1987;317:653–658.
14. Herridge MS, Cheung AM, Tansey CM, Matte-Martyn A, Diaz-Granados N, Al-Saiedi F, Cooper AB, Guest CB, Mazer CD, Mehta S, et al. Canadian Critical Care Trials Group: one-year outcomes in survivors of the acute respiratory distress syndrome. *N Engl J Med* 2003;348:683–693.
15. Craddock CG. Corticosteroid-induced lymphopenia, immunosuppression and body defense. *Ann Intern Med* 1978;88:564–566.
16. Annane D, Sebille V, Charpentier C, Bollaert PE, Francois B, Korach JM, Capellier G, Cohen Y, Azoulay E, Troche G, et al. Effect of treatment with low doses of hydrocortisone and fludrocortisone on mortality in patients with septic shock. *JAMA* 2002;288:862–871.

DOI: 10.1164/rccm.2310004

# Competing Benefits of Tumor Necrosis Factor- $\alpha$ for Bacteria and for Host Defense

The cytokine tumor necrosis factor- $\alpha$  (TNF- $\alpha$ ) functions as an endogenous alarm signal that coordinates gene expression and cellular activity, driving inflammatory responses to infection, injury, or irritation. In addition to stimulating host cell responses, TNF- $\alpha$  causes some bacteria to increase their net growth in culture (1). This observation suggests the hypothesis that TNF- $\alpha$  could exacerbate bacterial infection, which was tested by Lee and coworkers (2) and reported in this issue of the *Journal* (pp. 1462–1470).

Lee and coworkers studied the *in vitro* and *in vivo* effects of TNF- $\alpha$  on two gram-negative bacteria that cause pneumonia in patients with compromised host defenses, *Escherichia coli* and *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* (2). *E. coli* responded to recombinant soluble TNF- $\alpha$  with increased growth *in vitro*. This effect of TNF- $\alpha$  on bacterial growth was dose-dependent and inhibited

by blocking antibodies against TNF- $\alpha$ . In contrast, the *in vitro* growth of *P. aeruginosa* was not affected by either TNF- $\alpha$  or anti-TNF- $\alpha$  antibodies. That is, recombinant TNF- $\alpha$  *in vitro* stimulated the growth of *E. coli* but not *P. aeruginosa*.

To study the effects of endogenous TNF- $\alpha$  *in vivo* on bacterial growth in the lungs, Lee and coworkers used mice with a gene-targeted deficiency of TNF- $\alpha$  (2). They rendered both wild type and TNF- $\alpha$ -deficient mice neutropenic by injecting them with cyclophosphamide, and they infected mice by intranasal inoculation with bacteria. When neutropenic mice were infected with *E. coli* (which grew in response to TNF- $\alpha$  *in vitro*), there were significantly more living bacteria in the lungs of wild-type mice compared with TNF- $\alpha$ -deficient mice (2). In contrast, when mice were infected with *P. aeruginosa* (which was not responsive to TNF- $\alpha$  *in vitro*), the number of living *P. aeruginosa* per lung was not affected by

TNF- $\alpha$  deficiency (2). Thus, in neutropenic mice, the endogenous host cytokine TNF- $\alpha$  promoted the growth of responsive bacteria and worsened the infectious burden in the lungs.

These data from experimental pneumonias in mice suggest that, for some immunocompromised patients, the end result of TNF- $\alpha$  may be an exacerbated bacterial infection. Such a contention encourages new directions for research. For example, it will be important to determine whether acute interruption of TNF- $\alpha$ , such as with soluble receptors or blocking antibodies, can ameliorate bacterial growth in immunocompromised lungs. Additional settings of immunosuppression should be considered to determine how broadly applicable the findings with cyclophosphamide-treated mice are to immunocompromised lungs. Finally, elucidating the mechanisms by which some bacteria sense and respond to TNF- $\alpha$ , likely involving surface receptors on the bacteria (3), may identify rational targets for potential adjunctive antibacterial therapies. Selectively interrupting the responses of bacteria to TNF- $\alpha$  could limit bacterial multiplication and thereby benefit immunocompromised patients, especially if they are treated to augment TNF- $\alpha$  (4).

For mice that had not been rendered neutropenic with cyclophosphamide, the effect of TNF- $\alpha$  deficiency during infection was markedly different. During pneumonia caused by either *E. coli* or *P. aeruginosa*, TNF- $\alpha$  deficiency significantly increased bacterial burdens in the lungs and increased mortality (2). Decreased recruitment and activation of neutrophils was likely responsible for the increased bacterial burden (2). These data indicate that, when neutrophils were available, the role of TNF- $\alpha$  in coordinating inflammatory responses to bacteria in the lungs was more important than its stimulation of bacterial growth.

The magnitude of these effects of TNF- $\alpha$  deficiency in mice without neutropenia was remarkable. After 24 hours of infection, TNF- $\alpha$  deficiency increased the bacterial burden in the lungs by an astonishing 5–7 logs, or 100,000- to 10,000,000-fold. In previous studies, soluble inhibitors of TNF- $\alpha$  (5–8) or the genetic ablation of TNF- $\alpha$  receptors (9, 10) have been found to affect bacterial clearance in the lungs by 1 log (10-fold) or less. Moreover, whereas interruption of the gene for TNF- $\alpha$  prevented approximately 90% of neutrophil recruitment in response to either *E. coli* or *P. aeruginosa* (2), interruption of the genes for both known receptors for TNF- $\alpha$  does not decrease neutrophil recruitment during pneumonia caused by either bacteria (9, 10). Thus, these studies of bacterial pneumonia in mice with a genetic deficiency of TNF- $\alpha$  suggest far greater roles for TNF- $\alpha$  than observed in previous reports. These results may reflect differences among study designs, but they also raise the provocative hypothesis that the lifelong deficiency of TNF- $\alpha$  ligand may increase neutrophil recruitment and bacterial killing by mechanisms not inhibited either by the acute disruption of TNF- $\alpha$  ligand–receptor interactions or by the lifelong deficiency of TNF- $\alpha$  receptors.

In addition to killing bacteria, inflammation driven by TNF- $\alpha$  can disrupt and compromise respiratory and circulatory physiology. Excessive proinflammatory cytokines contribute to acute lung injury and systemic shock (11–14). When not absolutely essential for eradicating a microbe, interrupting signaling from proinflammatory cytokines, including TNF- $\alpha$ , may diminish inflammation and preserve pulmonary and cardiovascular function during pneumonia (15, 16).

Thus, diverse effects of TNF- $\alpha$  determine the outcome of bacterial pneumonia. TNF- $\alpha$  promotes bacterial killing, but compromises pulmonary and cardiovascular performance. Interestingly, the genetic deficiency of TNF- $\alpha$  may have more substantial effects on inflammation and bacterial killing than does the acute interruption of ligand–receptor interactions or the genetic deficiency of

TNF- $\alpha$  receptors for reasons that remain to be determined. In addition to these effects on host cells, TNF- $\alpha$  stimulates the multiplication of some bacteria. In neutropenic mice, this effect of TNF- $\alpha$  on bacteria can exacerbate respiratory infection. These novel findings highlight important research directions relevant to immunocompromised patients with or at risk for bacterial pneumonia.

**Conflict of Interest Statement:** J.P.M. has no declared conflict of interest.

JOSEPH P. MIZGERD, Sc.D.  
Harvard School of Public Health  
Boston, Massachusetts

## References

1. Meduri GU, Kanangat S, Stefan J, Tolley E, Schaberg D. Cytokines IL-1 $\beta$ , IL-6, and TNF- $\alpha$  enhance *in vitro* growth of bacteria. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1999;160:961–967.
2. Lee J-H, Del Sorbo L, Khine AA, de Azavedo J, Low DE, Bell D, Uhlig S, Slutsky AS, Zhang H. Modulation of bacterial growth by tumor necrosis factor- $\alpha$  *in vitro* and *in vivo*. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2003; 168:1462–1470.
3. Luo G, Niesel DW, Shaban RA, Grimm EA, Klimpel GR. Tumor necrosis factor alpha binding to bacteria: evidence for a high-affinity receptor and alteration of bacterial virulence properties. *Infect Immun* 1993;61: 830–835.
4. Moore TA, Standiford TJ. Cytokine immunotherapy during bacterial pneumonia: from benchtop to bedside. *Semin Respir Infect* 2001;16: 27–37.
5. Kolls JK, Lei D, Nelson S, Summer WR, Greenberg S, Beutler B. Adenovirus-mediated blockade of tumor necrosis factor in mice protects against endotoxic shock yet impairs pulmonary host defense. *J Infect Dis* 1995;171:570–575.
6. Laichalk LL, Kunkel SL, Strieter RM, Danforth JM, Bailie MB, Standiford TJ. Tumor necrosis factor mediates lung antibacterial host defenses in murine *Klebsiella* pneumonia. *Infect Immun* 1996;64:5211–5218.
7. van der Poll T, Keogh CV, Buurman WA, Lowry SF. Passive immunization against tumor necrosis factor- $\alpha$  impairs host defense during pneumococcal pneumonia in mice. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 1997;155: 603–608.
8. Rezaiguia S, Garat C, Delclaux C, Meignan M, Fleury J, Legrand P, Matthay MA, Jayr C. Acute bacterial pneumonia in rats increases alveolar epithelial fluid clearance by a tumor necrosis factor-alpha-dependent mechanism. *J Clin Invest* 1997;99:325–335.
9. Skerrett SJ, Martin TR, Chi EY, Peschon JJ, Mohler KM, Wilson CB. Role of the type 1 TNF receptor in lung inflammation after inhalation of endotoxin or *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. *Am J Physiol Lung Cell Mol Physiol* 1999;276:L715–L727.
10. Mizgerd JP, Peschon JJ, Doerschuk CM. Roles of tumor necrosis factor signaling during murine *Escherichia coli* pneumonia in mice. *Am J Respir Cell Mol Biol* 2000;22:85–91.
11. Sime PJ, Marr RA, Gauldie D, Xing Z, Hewlett BR, Graham FL, Gauldie J. Transfer of tumor necrosis factor-alpha to rat lung induces severe pulmonary inflammation and patchy interstitial fibrogenesis with induction of transforming growth factor-beta1 and myofibroblasts. *Am J Pathol* 1998;153:825–832.
12. Kolb M, Margetts PJ, Anthony DC, Pitossi F, Gauldie J. Transient expression of IL-1 beta induces acute lung injury and chronic repair leading to pulmonary fibrosis. *J Clin Invest* 2001;107:1529–1536.
13. Cohen J. The immunopathogenesis of sepsis. *Nature* 2002;420:885–891.
14. Mizgerd JP, Lupa MM, Kogan MS, Warren HB, Kobzik L, Topulos GP. Nuclear factor- $\kappa$ B p50 limits inflammation and prevents lung injury during *Escherichia coli* pneumonia. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2003; 168:810–817.
15. Kurahashi K, Kajikawa O, Sawa T, Ohara M, Gropper MA, Frank DW, Martin TR, Wiener-Kronish JP. Pathogenesis of septic shock in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* pneumonia. *J Clin Invest* 1999;104:743–750.
16. Mizgerd JP, Spieker MR, Doerschuk CM. Early response cytokines and innate immunity: essential roles for TNFR1 and IL1R1 during *Escherichia coli* pneumonia in mice. *J Immunol* 2001;166:4042–4048.